

Theology on the Web.org.uk

Making Biblical Scholarship Accessible

This document was supplied for free educational purposes. Unless it is in the public domain, it may not be sold for profit or hosted on a webserver without the permission of the copyright holder.

If you find it of help to you and would like to support the ministry of Theology on the Web, please consider using the links below:



Buy me a coffee

<https://www.buymeacoffee.com/theology>



PATREON

<https://patreon.com/theologyontheweb>

PayPal

<https://paypal.me/robbradshaw>

A table of contents for *The Expository Times* can be found here:

https://biblicalstudies.org.uk/articles_expository-times_01.php

pdfs are named: [Volume]_[Issue]_[1st page of article].pdf

is in them must be the love of Christ shed abroad in their hearts. There is no sorrow or affliction which does not bring with it new gifts of the love of Christ, no sorrow or affliction which has not its undertone of triumph over it in Christ who loves us. 'For I am persuaded that neither

death, nor life, nor angels, nor principalities, nor powers, nor things present, nor things to come, nor height, nor depth, nor any other creature, shall be able to separate us from the love of God, which is in Christ Jesus our Lord.'¹

¹ H. M. Gwatkin, *The Sacrifice of Thankfulness.*

Recent Foreign Theology.

'Evangelical Catholicism.'

ROMAN CATHOLICISM [was 'the spiritual fatherland' of Dr. Friedrich Heiler, who is now Professor of the Comparative History of Religion in the University of Marburg. In the course of his religious pilgrimage from the strictest Ultramontanism to Evangelical Catholicism, he found temporary halting-places, first in Reformed Catholicism 'dogmatically correct, but open-minded and progressive,' and later in Catholic Modernism 'imperilling dogma, but cherishing the religious spirit of primitive Catholicism.' His special studies have laid bare the diverse roots of Roman Catholicism, and he has been greatly influenced by the Archbishop of Upsala's earnest pleading for the re-uniting of Christendom in an Evangelical Catholicism. Under the auspices of Dr. Söderblom, Professor Heiler has delivered, in the Universities of Upsala and Lund, also in Stockholm, six lectures which, since their publication in a single volume,² have been much discussed both in Germany and in Sweden. The formidable task of comparing the relative merits and demerits of Protestantism and Romanism is attempted with Harnack's dictum as the guiding principle: 'The false method in controversy is the comparison of the good *theory* of one's own church with the bad *practice* of another. Theory ought to be compared with theory, and practice with practice.'

'Catholicism is Syncretism' is the theme of the first lecture. The researches of the last thirty years have shown that it is 'the product of an enormously complex evolutionary process which has been going on for centuries.' It is a '*complexio*

² *Das Wesen des Katholizismus*, von Friedrich Heiler, Dr. Phil.; ausserordentlicher Professor der vergleichenden Religionsgeschichte an der Universität Marburg. München, 1920: Ernst Reinhardt.

oppositorum, a unique amalgam of entirely diverse elements, almost all the important non-Christian religions having furnished stones for the building of the mighty Catholic church.' In the East the syncretism of popular religion and ecclesiasticism, of theology and mysticism was firmly established in the sixth and seventh centuries; but in the West the process continued throughout the Middle Ages. 'Thomas Aquinas, with the help of the Aristotelian categories, included in one comprehensive and logical system faith and knowledge, authority and freedom, mysticism and scholasticism, religion and politics, evangelical and hierarchical elements, Augustinianism and Aristotelianism.' When Syncretism had reached its climax, there came the powerful reaction of the Lutheran Reformation, which, so far from destroying Catholicism, resulted in the welding of the *Summa Theologia* of Aquinas into the binding dogmas of the Council of Trent. Heiler sees in the decrees of that Council a fettering of evangelical freedom which was the beginning of a policy, the ultimate effect of which was Vaticanism and the assumption of all power by the Pope and the Roman Curia. 'Nevertheless, in its magnificent syncretism Catholicism includes religious treasures so varied that living piety may from it derive nourishment.'

The main elements in this Syncretism are five: Paganism, or primitive religion; Judaism, the religion of law; Romanism, the religion of hierarchical prerogative; Hellenism, the religion of mysticism; and Evangelicalism, the religion of gospel revelation. Survivals of primitive Paganism are found in popular conceptions of the Real Presence, in tendencies towards polytheism, and especially in Mariolatry. 'When I ceased to pray to Mary, I was no longer a devout Catholic, I had become, inwardly, an evangelical Christian.' Late Judaism and Islam are the two typical examples of

religious legalism. In these religions the law is contained in sacred books and is expounded by Rabbis and Ulemas. But in Catholicism the living, infallible Church takes the place of the authoritative book. 'Obedience to the law of God is for a strict Catholic synonymous with obedience to the ecclesiastical authority.' By two different priests Heiler was refused absolution because he could not accept the dogma of the Immaculate Conception of Mary proclaimed in 1854, and he acknowledges that their action was entirely correct. 'Faith signifies obedience, absolute submission to authority.' To ancient Rome the priestly jurisprudence of Roman Catholicism is traced, but the 'note' of the truly Christian Church is not insistence on rights, but inculcation of duties. Hierarchy is a *contradictio in adjecto*; 'holiness and lordship are like fire and water, for no man attains to holiness without humility, meekness and service.'

So far Heiler has dwelt on the darker side of his theme, making it plain always that it is not individuals but a system that he is condemning. With manifest relief he proceeds, in the third lecture, to show that in Catholic piety there is a higher mystical as well as an evangelical element. For many Romanists Catholicism is nothing but Mysticism; everything else is merely the protecting husk. And by mysticism is meant 'that deep individual piety of the heart for which there is room even in rigid Catholicism.' This mystical piety is, however, remote from Catholicism as commonly understood. Yet, inasmuch as mysticism is a religion of passivity, shunning strife and struggle, submitting to the hardest yoke, Catholic mystics humbly submit to papal claims and joyfully sacrifice the intellect when required to renounce their own theological theories. Sacramentalism is also harmonized with this spiritual religion, for by means of symbols and rites those who are incapable of higher mystical experiences may learn something of the secret. Moreover, for mystics themselves the eucharistic elements are the outward sign of God's gracious presence for which they long. 'All the awe and rapture of mystical devotion and adoration are experienced by the pious soul as the great moment approaches when the priest transubstantiates the bread into the body of Christ.' From the higher forms of the mystical piety of Catholicism, evangelical Christians have much to learn, but although there is evan-

gelical Christianity at the heart of Catholicism, it is only one of five components and does not always dominate the pagan, legal, hierarchical, and mystical elements. Luther proclaimed the ideal of personal religion, but as yet the ideal of a universal evangelical Church has not been realized. That ideal is not a syncretism in which the gospel of Christ is only one element along with others, but a universalism which rests upon an evangelical basis; in other words, it is Evangelical Catholicism.

The purpose of the fourth lecture on 'Catholic and Evangelical Christianity' is to show that Catholicism and Evangelicalism are different forms of Christianity and that the Roman Curia has no more right to deny that Evangelicals are true Christians than Protestants have to assert that Catholicism is a relapse into heathenism. 'Evangelical Christianity presents a higher religious ideal; but in Catholicism there is a richer and more diversified religious life.' The Christian ideal of *piety* is evangelical, but the Christian ideal of *the Church* is Catholic, albeit purified. Perfected Christianity must include both ideals. Two ways lead to the desired goal. The existence of an evangelical element in Catholicism implies the possibility of its reformation. Many earnest Romanists long for a 'religious Catholicism,' which means a Catholicism freed from pagan superstition, from Jewish legalism, and from Romish hierarchism. To attain this end has been the aim of Catholic Modernism, but it has been too greatly influenced by Catholic Mysticism and has possessed too little of the evangelical spirit. Owing, however, to the unyielding attitude of the Roman bureaucracy, Heiler thinks it is more likely that the goal of an evangelical Catholicism will be reached by following the lead of the Archbishop of Upsala, who holds that on an evangelical foundation a new great Church may be erected which, in architectonic majesty and internal dignity shall compare favourably with the ancient Catholic Church. This is no modern conception. Lessing, and after him Geiger, expressed the hope that to the Petrine Church (the Roman Catholic) and to the Pauline Church (the Evangelical) there should succeed the Johannine Church—the ideal Christian Church.

In his fifth lecture Dr. Heiler acknowledges that to speak of 'Evangelical Catholicism' is to combine two words which represent 'two religious worlds, which have, it is true, many elements in common, but are nevertheless so entirely different

in principle that for those who live in one it is exceedingly difficult to penetrate into the inward realm of the other.' Many years of laborious study and painful conflict have given him an inner view of both forms of Christianity and inspired him with the hope of a future synthesis. 'Evangelical Catholicism' implies 'the shaping and transforming of the Catholic ideal by an Evangelical spirit.' Under five headings the possibility of re-minting the fine gold whilst rejecting the dross is considered.

1. *Ecclesia una.*—In the Roman Catholic Church the conception of unity has found effective although distorted expression. In the *una evangelica ecclesia* there must be room for the ritual of the High Churchman and the Puritanism of the Calvinist, for the elaborately organized National Church and the freedom-loving sects. But it is not evangelical to maintain a sectarian isolation. Rome's claim to infallibility and her insistence on unconditional submission make the realization of the ideal of a universal Christian Church impossible; all the more important is it to strive for the union of the non-Roman churches. This union would be no rigid ecclesiastical system with fixed regulations, but a living society which, notwithstanding the differences which separate its members one from another, is conscious of its oneness in Christ its Head, and unites in common efforts to spread the Kingdom of God. 'Evangelical Catholicism' will translate into deeds the words of St. Paul: 'We, who are many, are one body' (1 Co 10¹⁷).

2. *Authority.*—The fundamental difference between the Romish and the Evangelical principle of authority is that, in the former case, it is institutional, and in the latter it is personal. Heiler favours the Episcopal form of Church government, rejoicing that the revolution in Germany has swept away that grotesque caricature of ecclesiastical dignity, which conferred upon the Emperor the *Summepiskopat*. The Evangelical Bishop will illustrate in the fulfilment of his pastoral duties the apostolic word: 'Not that we have lordship over your faith, but are helpers of your joy' (2 Co 1²⁴).

3. *The Confessional.*—Heiler expresses the warmest appreciation of the moral and spiritual guidance given to devout inquirers by many a father confessor who is, in every respect, what the

Eastern Church calls him, a *πνευματικός πατήρ*. But *corruptio optimi pessima* applies here. In the study of casuistry many Romish priests lose that sound judgment and that delicate tact which are essential for the right discharge of this most difficult of all their duties. In 'Evangelical Catholicism,' as it is here described, the confessor would not be responsible to the Pope, but only to God. His duty would not be to expound a code of moral rules, but to point to Jesus as the Christian's example and the sinner's friend. On this subject, many will not follow Heiler in every detail who are in general sympathy with him. In other modes of Christian fellowship they will obey the Apostolic injunction: 'Confess your sins one to another' (Ja 5¹⁶).

4. *Divine Worship.*—Full justice is done to the solemnity and impressiveness of Roman Catholic ceremonial; with its æsthetic attractiveness Evangelical services cannot compare. Yet, speaking from his own experience when for the first time he worshipped in an Evangelical church, Heiler says: 'As the minister offered the Lord's prayer from the pulpit, there came over me the same deep inward devotional feeling of which I was formerly conscious during the act of consecration in the Mass. . . . In the Catholic liturgy the Lord's prayer is only a sacred formulary which is recited or sung, too often mechanically.' On the other hand, the defect in the worship of Protestant churches is said to be lack of fervency in corporate prayer. What is needed is a synthesis of the subjective and the objective in worship.

5. *Mysticism.*—By the mystical experience of her great saints Roman Catholic worship has been inspired and enriched. 'Evangelical Catholicism,' whilst fully aware of the perils of quietism, ecstasy, etc., cannot dispense with the mystical element in piety. 'Modern Evangelical Christianity needs greater fervency of spirit, an intenser realization of the Divine presence, in a word more mysticism.' Hence 'Evangelical Catholicism' will be a synthesis of mystical and evangelical religion, but in the centre there will be not mystical conception but gospel truths. 'The Church which is at once Evangelical and Catholic, Christian and universal—the Church whose soul is evangelical and whose body is catholic—this is the ideal Church.'

J. G. TASKER.

Handsworth College, Birmingham.