

Theology on the Web.org.uk

Making Biblical Scholarship Accessible

This document was supplied for free educational purposes. Unless it is in the public domain, it may not be sold for profit or hosted on a webserver without the permission of the copyright holder.

If you find it of help to you and would like to support the ministry of Theology on the Web, please consider using the links below:



Buy me a coffee

<https://www.buymeacoffee.com/theology>



PATREON

<https://patreon.com/theologyontheweb>

[PayPal](#)

<https://paypal.me/robbradshaw>

A table of contents for *The Churchman* can be found here:

https://biblicalstudies.org.uk/articles_churchman_os.php

that Episcopacy is a development from a system of bishop-Priests (priests with the power of transmission of Orders), they would yet have to prove that their own elders were priests possessing this power. When, therefore, without waiting for the Presbyterians to prove to us this latter point, Mr. Ferguson demands full "recognition of the ministry . . . of the Presbyterian Church," he is asking us to give up part of our Catholic heritage. For although, as he rightly points out, our Church has laid down no *theory* of the ministry, yet she has clung fast to the all-important *fact* of the preservation of full Apostolical Succession. We cannot, therefore, recognize Presbyterian Orders till it is proved that those Orders are in the line of the Apostolical Succession, unless we are fully prepared to accept the principle such action would involve, namely, that in default of the granting of Episcopal and Catholic authority for the exercise by Presbyterian ministers of the transmitting function, the action of the whole Presbyterian body acting corporately as a Christian Ecclesia is to be considered as granting sufficient authority and validity to such exercise, in view of the manifest blessing of the Holy Spirit shown ever since upon the work of Presbyterian ministries.

H. T. MALAHER.

"GAINS AND LOSSES."

(*The Churchman*, February, 1911, p. 89.)

BISHOP WALPOLE, in the February number, endeavours to confine the "Resurrection," in which all Christians believe, to "the just," and suggests that "the resurrection of the unjust" may not mean "anything more than their immortality" (p. 95). This is not the doctrine of the three Creeds, especially the "Quicumque Vult," which says that "*all men shall rise again with their bodies*"; and surely he must have overlooked the plain words of our Lord in St. John v. 28: "The hour is coming in the which *all that are in the graves shall hear His voice, and shall come forth*—they that have done good, unto the resurrection of life; and they that have done ill, unto the resurrection of judgment."

G. F. W. MUNBY.



Notices of Books.

THE CONSTITUTION AND LAW OF THE CHURCH IN THE FIRST TWO CENTURIES.

By Adolf Harnack. Translated by F. L. Pogson, M.A. Edited by H. D. A. Major, Vice-Principal of Ripon Clergy College. London: *Williams and Norgate*. Price 5s. net. Pp. i-xiv, 1-349.

Harnack's last book is not as brilliant and as lucid as his *St. Luke* and *Acts*, but it exhibits in equal degree the painstaking and whole-hearted devotion to truth which makes his work, as it made Hort's, so wonderfully

attractive. Again, we see the writer's mind in revolt from the doctrinaire hypercriticism of his compatriots, and steadily working on the critical side to a more conservative position. Again, we feel that this intellectual tendency is not unconnected with a religious earnestness which brings him into sympathy with his data. But, again, there is no trace of that advance from a low Christology, which one or two passages in "What is Christianity?" seemed to indicate to be possible. Indeed, the reader must be prepared for one or two painful sentences. Yet in a short but important note on the Trinitarian formula, we have the argument that the formula originated between A.D. 50 and 80 as an anti-Jewish product of the Christian religion, and a dismissal with contemptuous brevity of "Babylonian, Greek, or Kamschatkan triads" (p. 273). In the preface, Harnack writes: "In the Christian preaching at a very early period the Trinitarian confession came to the front and gave the new religion its distinctive stamp" (p. x), but unfortunately he ignores Dean Robinson's important argument (Hastings, *s.v.* Communion) for a subjective use of the genitive in "fellowship of the Holy Ghost." There are two long and interesting notes on the phrases "Gospel" and "Word of God."

When he turns to the main body of the work, the reader of the *CHURCH-MAN* will find himself confronted with a position which is from his standpoint of special interest. As he reads the criticism of Catholicism he will continually ask himself what the writer's position would have been if he had known intimately and from within a Catholic position which was not Romanist. His sense of Harnack's largeness of outlook and superiority to his environment will be confirmed when he reads the remarkable words with which the essay concludes: "Meanwhile the nations of Western Europe still live as Catholics or as Protestants. There is as yet no third course open. That they are the one or the other is still more important than the amount of philosophical and scientific enlightenment or the number of mechanical appliances which they possess. Luther has created this condition of things. In the meanwhile the nations are still waiting for a third kind of Church as the foundation of their higher life." Yet there is a Protestant Church in the West whose constitution and law Luther's influence hardly touched, and whose thought on matters ecclesiastical has influenced Harnack, for he quotes with approval Salmon's words: "If the original constitution of the Church was not the same as in the time of Irenæus, it must have been capable of an inner development to the later form." (In passing we observe that at this point also Harnack rejects Gentilic influences.) But if Salmon is quoted there is no allusion to one of the greatest masters of theology, Hort, who nowhere did better work than in this connection. That Harnack would not have found the English writer's thought wholly alien from his own is proved by a sentence occurring in the appendix which is devoted to the criticism of Sohm, and which proves the strength of Harnack's reaction from Lutheran individualism: "The social body is not the Church which exists for faith, but it is the form of its earthly realization, so far as it can be realized on earth" (p. 214). Ecclesiastical law, therefore, may be "a necessary means for the realization and accomplishment on earth of what the Church essentially is." Sohm's theory, which Harnack in these words rejects, is the philosophical expression of a way of thinking which is

largely prevalent on this side the Channel outside the Church of England, and is not without its influence among ourselves.

On the historical side, Harnack is less lucid (partly, it may be, because he is too brief), but he is always interesting. It is, of course, impossible within the limits of a short notice to mention, still less to appreciate and criticize, the countless points of importance which arise in the review of the Scriptural and early Patristic evidence. But while there is much which looks, or seems to look, the other way, there is the recognition of "the universal apostolic organization" (p. 59) and of a common law based on the practice of St. Paul and other missionaries to the Gentiles. The ideas approved in these sentences are of the greatest possible moment, and receive quite inadequate attention. They, at any rate, should have prevented the dismissal of Clement's appeal to the "command" of the Apostles as "a momentous fiction" (p. 94). In the reviewer's opinion Clement is appealing to a document which probably lay before Clement as he wrote (*cf.* "Layman's Ordinances"); and the appeal of Ignatius to the ordinances of the Apostles confirms the impression. But any such document or undocumented vein of generally accepted presumption must fall within the Apostolic period, and, at any rate, have some claim to represent the Apostolic "common law," the existence of which Harnack admits. The word "fiction" is far too strong. Moreover, at this point the evidence is not stated quite fully. The data are very puzzling, but there is at a very early date a vein of allusion which suggests a development of the idea of Acts i. 3. To this tendency of primitive thought Harnack makes practically no allusion. We must not omit to notice the extremely important *obiter dictum* of p. 64, that the John of the Epistles was "probably identical with John of the Apocalypse." Harnack, if we remember rightly, here substitutes "probably" for an earlier "possibly."

The translation is satisfactory, but we must express our very strong dissent from the opinion of the editor that no index was necessary. There are few books an index to which is more needed. The absence of it much diminishes the value of an important and useful work of reference. The note on p. 53 seems to be by the editor. If so, it ought not to have been printed in the text. The point is not unimportant. H. J. BARDSLEY.

THE GROWTH OF THE GOSPELS. By W. M. Flinders Petrie. London: John Murray. Price 2s. 6d. net.

A book on the Gospels by one of our leading archæologists naturally and necessarily calls for special attention, and though the book is small, it is decidedly valuable, whether we can agree with it or not. Dr. Petrie believes that "the fundamental question of the relation of the Gospels to each other must precede any exact understanding of their teaching." He also remarks that hitherto the dominant point of view has been "mainly literary and subjective, and hence it has been largely influenced by personal judgment" (p. 2). With this we readily agree. He believes that the discovery of the papyrus "has changed our mental atmosphere and realization of the subject," and "raises a new field of questions" (p. 3). Another point of interest is the opinion that the Churches before and soon after A.D. 50 needed Gospels, and that "it is impossible to suppose that they were left at that time without a written account of the principal events and teaching which they were

wishing to follow. Some generally accepted Gospels must have been already in circulation before A.D. 60. The mass of briefer records . . . must have been welded together within ten or twenty years by the external necessities" (p. 7). This opinion in the light of Sir William Ramsay's recent article on the subject is full of significance. Again, Dr. Petrie is of opinion that "a criticism which depends on a personal judgment will inevitably reflect personal variation" (p. 9), and he therefore posits the need of an impersonal criticism which depends upon general principles. Then comes his statement of the principles. He distinguishes between four kinds of criticism: Structural, Textual, Verbal, and Historical. He starts with what he calls "Structural Criticism," and he regards this as applicable to those episodes which are identical in all three Gospels. This he calls the "Nucleus," or common basis, on which the Gospel has been built (p. 14). Five other classes of material are then discussed in order, and he believes that in such a classification there is no room for personal opinion, but that the facts arrange themselves, and provide a firm platform for all subsequent historical discussion and personal judgment of detail (p. 17). How Dr. Petrie works out his thesis we must necessarily leave our readers to discover. But he believes that the Nucleus was compiled in Jerusalem quite early, and that all classes of later editions have Galilean detail. The Jewish element he would date about A.D. 40, and the Gentile A.D. 50-60. Mark and Luke, in his view, collaborated on additions to the Nucleus A.D. 54-60. Some may think that Dr. Petrie's view is unduly complex, but it is certainly deserving of careful study. He has given us a contribution to the study of the Gospels which cannot be overlooked.

W. H. GRIFFITH THOMAS.

LETHABY OF MOAB. By Thomas Durley. London: *Marshall Bros.* Price 6s.

JOHN G. PATON: LATER YEARS AND FAREWELL. By A. K. Langridge. London: *Hodder and Stoughton.* Price 3s. 6d.

LEPERS. By John Jackson. London: *Marshall Bros.* Price 3s. 6d.

One of the happiest signs of the times—that there is so large an output of missionary books. We assume that they find readers: these three at least deserve to do so. It is a happy sign, too, that the missionary books of to-day are not mere collections of missionary stories, but that they grapple with missionary problems, and face missionary difficulties with real courage and hopefulness. Readers of John Paton's autobiography will be glad, indeed, to add these supplementary chapters to their library, whilst students of Bible lands and Bible times will be glad to study the Lethabys' work in Moab and the story of thirty-six years' work amongst those afflicted with that terribly symbolic disease which our Lord so often was pleased to heal.

THE PURPOSE OF GOD. By J. Llewelyn Davies. London: *Macmillan and Co.* Price 2s. 6d. net.

This small volume of short sermons is designed to "illustrate the Gospel of the Kingdom of Heaven which was announced by our Lord, and which, after being strangely overlooked by the Church, has been rediscovered in the New Testament, and is slowly breathing new life into the Christianity of our time." With this thesis many will be found to disagree, for there is little evidence that Evangelical preachers at any rate have failed to proclaim the

Kingdom of Heaven or to teach its ethics. Nor is there anything in these sermons of so striking a nature as to accord them any special place as the messages of a newer and better order. They are, however, good, cultured, and acceptable sermons, true to the Person of Christ, and stating His claims in language suited to the modern mind. Their outlook is broad, and their obvious sincerity will commend them to thinking people. The least convincing chapter is the Appendix, on "Life under Insoluble Problems," which states difficulties without giving much help toward the comprehension of their personal significance, or guidance as to the necessary attitude of heart and life toward them.

THE SON OF MAN. By Edwin A. Abbott. *Cambridge University Press.*
Pp. 920. Price 16s. 6d. net.

This is volume viii. of the series of Diatessarica, and beyond all question it is the most monumental work in Dr. Abbott's monumental series. It fulfils a promise. In 1909 he issued a small work called "The Message of the Son of Man," in which he put forward tentatively, and with a view to criticism, a new theory about the origin and meaning of that much-disputed phrase, "Son of Man." In this book he gives with extraordinary fulness and minuteness the evidence upon which his theory is based, and then applies the new meaning to all the relevant Gospel passages, which are conveniently classified for the purpose. The reader is constantly met with the marks, not merely of profound scholarship, but of originality and real insight, and again and again new and very suggestive interpretations are offered for familiar passages. Dr. Abbott does not apparently believe in the Apostolic authorship of the Fourth Gospel. He also doubts whether we Christians know nearly as much about what Christ said and did as we suppose that we do. Yet he holds that "St. John" is a much better authority for the mind of Christ than St. Mark. St. John's spiritual bias is nearer the truth than St. Mark's non-spiritual bias. For Jesus was "a zealot and a mystic, wholly absorbed in God and . . . in zeal for God's temple," which temple consists of redeemed humanity. Therefore Jesus was much better understood by Paul and John than by the Synoptists, and the two writers faithfully reproduce his thoughts. Hence "we may be consoled for having to give up our old confidence about the precise nature of some things that Jesus is alleged to have said and done if we can gain a new confidence about what Jesus thought." Now, we can find out what Jesus thought only by searching for every possible allusion, direct and indirect, obvious and concealed, understood or misunderstood, which the Gospels contain, to the Old Testament, the book which Jesus had studied for twenty years. It is interesting to find Dr. Abbott maintaining the importance of the Old Testament as against the Apocalyptic literature. He is very sceptical about most of the alleged New Testament parallels to Enoch, and he sides with Dr. Plummer against Dr. Charles in their recent controversy about the relative dependence of Matthew and the Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs. This principle applies particularly to the discussion of the "Son of Man." The phrase really comes from Ezekiel, and its content must be elicited by a study of the whole Old Testament from its beginning with Adam, but specially of the teaching of the Greater Prophets. Jesus wished to express the fact that He

had become one with humanity in all their weakness that He might be a second Adam and deliver them from the "griefs" and "iniquities" of which Isaiah speaks; and the work of the Son of Adam was completed when He could say: "Go unto *My brethren*, and say unto them, I ascend unto My Father and your Father, and to *My God* and *your God*."

THE BIBLE : A REVELATION FROM GOD. By Rev. George Henderson, B.D. Edinburgh : *T. and T. Clark.* Price 6d.

A small book with a great purpose. Mr. Henderson is not afraid of criticism, and he writes for those who fear it. He shows clearly and simply that in the light of all the criticism of to-day the Bible is still to be interpreted as a revelation from God.

TIM THE OWDACIOUS. By E. M. Green. London : *S.P.C.K.* Price 6d.

That the S.P.C.K. should publish such a book as this is indeed "owdacious." Tim is a little street-arab who is led to join a Bible-class. "Serving the King" is set before him as the great ideal. Will it be believed that this "serving of the King" is fulfilling the office of a server at Holy Communion? We are so often able to give unstinted praise to the story-books issued by the S.P.C.K. that we regret exceedingly to have to call attention to this most unsatisfactory book. Has it escaped the notice of the Committee owing to its smallness? We hope that this is the explanation.

THE FIRST EPISTLE GENERAL OF ST. JOHN. By the Rev. G. S. Barrett, D.D. A Devotional Commentary. London : *The Religious Tract Society.* Price 2s.

A new volume of the devotional commentary by one of the best-known and most honoured of Congregational ministers, whose earlier works have prepared us to look with interest and expectation for anything else from his pen. Readers will not be disappointed with what they find here, for they will obtain much to inform the mind and inspire the heart. This little work is so full of spiritual, evangelical, suggestive teaching that it will provide ample material for all those who use these Epistles in their "Moments on the Mount."

HOLINESS SYMBOLIC AND REAL. By the Rev. J. Agar Beet, D.D. London : *Robert Culley.* Price 1s. 6d. net.

The author tells us that this little book is a Bible study, and embodies the results of an effort to "reproduce as accurately and thoroughly as possible the conception of holiness held by the writers of the New Testament," Dr. Beet is "deeply convinced that one of the greatest needs of the present day is accurate grammatical scholarship directed to the aim of obtaining a broader and deeper comprehension of God's purpose of mercy to men." In this conviction we heartily concur. Research must always be the basis of any true spirituality. In fourteen chapters the entire ground of the Bible-teaching on holiness is covered, and we are glad to have this conspectus from the standpoint of modern scholarship. In the later chapters we observe with interest and appreciation several indications of an approximation to unity among holiness teachers. It has generally been thought that the teaching represented by Keswick and that which is associated with the Methodist Churches is irreconcilable. Perhaps Dr. Beet's little volume will help to show both Keswick and Methodism how the two Schools may be brought together. We commend this admirable little work to the attention of all Christian people, and especially to those for whom it was primarily designed—"Pastors of the flock of Christ commissioned by Him to feed and teach."

MESSAGES FROM THE THRONE. By Mrs. Harding Kelly. London : *Robert Scott.* Price 1s. 6d. net.

A selection of very simple talks on Bible stories, etc., suitable for use by district visitors amongst the poor, and by other Christian workers who find it difficult of themselves to make the Bible interesting or intelligible to those amongst whom they work. It will be found most helpful in this respect, being direct in its spiritual teaching, bright in its methods of expression, and consistently true to the Evangel of God's grace.

THE WORK AND POWER OF THE HOLY SPIRIT. By W. Muspratt. London : *Elliot Stock.* Price 2s. net.

The writer is the resident Chaplain at Coonoor, India, and this small book contains a series of sermons preached there on the work of the Holy Spirit. They are very simple,

crude almost in some places, but on the whole are calculated to give a helpful conception of the work of the Comforter to those to whom they were originally preached, and to invest with new meaning for them the oft-expressed article in the Creed, "I believe in the Holy Ghost." They will prove of real use to ministers and Bible-class teachers who are anxious to give simple instruction to congregation or class on this all-important subject, and on this account alone we gladly commend the book to their notice.

HYMNS AND SPIRITUAL SONGS. By S. C. Lowry. London: *Longmans, Green and Co.* Price 2s. 6d. net.

A small collection of hymns and sacred verse, which will be valued for their spiritual message by those who like to have their own thoughts versified. For these hymns and poems are not profound, and their meaning is always to be found in the first reading—a quality which enhances the value of such a compilation for devotional use.

ST. PAUL IN DAILY LIFE. London: *H. R. Allenson.* Price 1s. 6d.

A selection from St. Paul's Epistles in the setting of the Acts of the Apostles arranged for daily reading throughout the year, in which period the book would be twice read through. The very words of Scripture alone are used, and their arrangement is carried out most carefully and well. A splendid "first thing in the morning" or "last thing at night" book.

THE COMPANION BIBLE. Being the Authorized Version of 1611, with the Structures and Notes—Critical, Explanatory, and Suggestive. Part II. Joshua to Job, with ten Appendices. Oxford University Press: *Henry Frowde.* Price 4s. net.

It is a misfortune that the principles upon which this book is proceeding are not reprinted from Part I. Its idea seems to be to print in one column the Authorized Version text, and in the other a close and sometimes fanciful and artificial analysis and some short explanatory notes. There is practically nothing by way of introductions to the books, but we gather that Job is pre-Mosaic. Ezra-Nehemiah affords the biggest surprise. Nehemiah is apparently identical with Sheshbazzar in Ezra i. 8; and Cyrus, King of Persia, is son of Astyages (=Ahasuerus) and Esther, and was trained by Mordecai and Nehemiah in the knowledge of God. Apart, however, from these somewhat revolutionary historical theories, the analysis may help towards getting a firmer grasp of the English text.

THE REJECTED KING. By Mrs. M. Baxter. London: *Christian Herald Office.* Price 1s. 6d.

A series of Bible studies on St. Matthew's Gospel. They will probably be acceptable to the general reader, though the exegesis is at times strained and fanciful. The combination of poor paper and small print makes the reading not a little trying.

Received: **THE ADVENT HOPE IN ST. PAUL'S EPISTLES.** By J. Armitage Robinson, D.D. London: *Longmans, Green and Co.* Price 1s. net. A series of three lectures delivered in the Abbey last Advent. **ST. PAUL.** By F. W. H. Myers. London: *H. R. Allenson, Ltd.* Price, cloth 6d., leather 1s. A tasteful little edition of Mr. Myers' well-known poem. **NOW AND THEN.** By Arthur H. Leake. London: *Marshall Bros.* Price 7s. 6d. Another and a somewhat complicated effort to explain the Apocalypse. **THE BIBLE AND WINE.** By Ferrar Fenton. London: *S. W. Partridge and Co.* Price 1s. net; cloth, 1s. 6d. An essay on the various texts referring to wine in the Bible. **OUR ENGLISH BIBLE.** By Rev. T. O. Bevan. London: *George Allen and Sons.* Price 6d. An interesting account of the Authorized Version. **SUGGESTIONS FOR A SYLLABUS IN RELIGIOUS TEACHING.** By G. B. Ayre. London: *Longmans, Green and Co.* Price 2s. net; paper, 1s. 6d. net. A valuable book for all engaged in the religious education of children. **THE POWER OF THE CROSS.** By H. T. Dixon, D.D. London: *Robert Scott.* Price 1s. 6d. A series of addresses on the Seven Words, simply written, but emphasizing their spiritual message. **HER HUNDREDFOLD.** By Marion Stewart Weir. London: *Marshall Bros.* Price 2s. 6d. An excellent story. **THE CLAVERLY CHILDREN.** By E. M. Robinson. London: *Marshall Bros.* Price 2s. 6d. **THE DOLLY DIALOGUES.** By Anthony Hope. London: *T. Nelson and Sons.* Price 7d. **THE STRENUOUS LIFE.** By Theodore Roosevelt. London: *T. Nelson and Sons.* Price 1s. **THE TALISMAN.** By Sir Walter Scott. London: *T. Nelson and Sons.* Price 6d. **WHERE BLACK RULES WHITE.** By H. Hesketh Prichard. London: *T. Nelson and Sons.* Price 1s. **TALES OF MYSTERY AND IMAGINATION.** By Edgar Allan Poe. London: *T. Nelson and Sons.* Price 6d. **HISTORICAL MYSTERIES.** By Andrew Lang. London: *T. Nelson and Sons.* Price 1s.