

Synoptists is a characteristic of all the Pauline writings, the Pastoral Epistles included,' (3) that 'without the use of a documentary source such a systematic derivation of Pauline language from the sayings of Jesus is incomprehensible,' (4) that 'Paulinism is, therefore, both as regards linguistic expressions and basal conceptions, derived from the Logia-source.'

These results will be received with respect and accepted with caution. Competent scholars will, doubtless, estimate the strength of each element in the cumulative argument. One statement may here be examined in greater detail: 'there are only eight of the Parables of Jesus to which no regard is paid in Paulinism.' But the value of this assertion is largely discounted, when it is also said that Paul made use of the ideas of the Parables, but not of the figurative language employed by Jesus. Even then, it is scarcely a plausible conjecture that the Parable of the Sower is the source of Paul's saying, 'If we sowed unto you spiritual things' (1 Co 9¹¹), or that the Parable of the Rich Man and Lazarus has any connexion with the Pauline idea of 'the propædeutic significance of Moses and the prophets.' On many questions of biblical criticism Dr. Resch incidentally passes

judgments which well deserve further notice. It is not possible to do more than chronicle, with pleasure, his hearty approval of Dr. Zahn's view of the 'Acts.' It is, he also thinks, a most certain result of comparative criticism that the author of the Acts of the Apostles wrote the entire book without any reference to the Epistles of Paul; that is to say, he neither utilized the wealth of historical material which these Epistles contain, nor does he manifest any intention to correct their assertions.

There is much in Dr. Resch's work to support writers like Feine, who maintains that 'Paul had the deepest understanding of the nature of the work of Jesus.' Also, the more closely his conveniently tabulated lists of parallels are studied, the more will wonder grow that Paulinism and the teaching of Jesus should be regarded as standing in a relation of mutual antagonism. But it is one thing to strengthen the evidence for believing that Paul was familiar with the main facts of the Gospel history and with the substance of the discourses of Jesus; it is another thing to demonstrate that Paul habitually made use of a particular Hebrew document, such as the 'Logia Jesu.'

J. G. TASKER.

Handsworth College.

Some Helps towards the Study of Dante.

BY THE REV. CANON SIR JOHN C. HAWKINS, BART., M.A., OXFORD.

THE writer of some articles on 'Dante as an Illustrator of Scripture,' which have lately appeared in THE EXPOSITORY TIMES (vol. xvi. pp. 393, 496, 547; vol. xvii. p. 37), has been invited to add to them some practical information as to the English books which seem to him most valuable as bearing upon the study of Dante. In attempting to comply with that invitation, he will almost exclusively limit himself—and the bibliography of the subject is so immense that the chief difficulty lies in limitation—to books which he himself has found most helpful towards understanding and enjoying the Divine Comedy, since he took up the study of it rather late in life, and with but slight previous knowledge of Italian. And he takes for granted, and will try to bear in mind, that the readers of this magazine are likely to be specially

interested in such books as bring out the moral and spiritual teachings of this many-sided poet.

The names of the publishers, and the prices, will be added to the titles of all the more recent books that are recommended. The prices marked (*) are net.

I. Introductory Manuals.

(a) Among the many modern introductions to the study of Dante, certainly none is superior, and probably none is equal in practical value, to Miss Maria F. Rossetti's *A Shadow of Dante* (Longmans; 3s. 6d.), the sub-title of which is 'An Essay towards studying himself, his World, and his Pilgrimage.' She has drawn up an admirably clear description of the course of action in the Divine Comedy, illustrated by four excellent diagrams, and she gives translations in blank verse—by her brother,

Mr. W. M. Rossetti, in the *Inferno*, and by Longfellow in the other two divisions of the poem—of many of the most attractive and important parts of the poem. The book, if read through carefully, is sufficient to serve for many people as a test of the probability of their appreciating and enjoying Dante,—for it must be admitted that he is not everyone's poet.

(b) Those who have within reach the older and slighter account of the poem by Mrs. Oliphant in her volume on *Dante* (2s. 6d.), in Blackwood's 'Foreign Classics for English Readers,' will find that, like all the gifted authoress's writings, it is clear and pleasant reading. And some people will welcome the frankness of her not infrequent admissions that certain passages of *Dante* will be found dull or incomprehensible by beginners, and therefore may be passed over by them, at least for the present.

(c) Here may also be named the volume on *Dante* in the Temple Primers (Dent; 1s.*). It is the work of an accomplished Roman Catholic writer, Mr. E. G. Gardner, and is full of accurate and closely packed matter—so closely packed, indeed, that it may have less attraction for beginners than for those who have made some progress.

II. Translations, Notes, and Commentaries. The most important matter of all is to make wise provision of these helps for those who are commencing the actual perusal of the Divine Comedy. And in so doing the requirements (i.) of those who have no knowledge, and (ii.) of those who have or intend to have some knowledge of Italian, have to be considered separately.

i. Where Dante can only be read in a translation, should that translation be in prose or verse? In the opinion of the present writer,¹ a rendering free from the trammels of metre is by far the more helpful towards a real understanding of any serious poem, and in this case he would especially recommend the Rev. H. F. Tozer's recently published prose translation (Clarendon Press; 3s. 6d.*).

But most people seem to prefer a metrical translation in the case of all poems; and to them two alternatives may be suggested.

¹ And since writing the above, he finds that this opinion may be fortified by the very high authority of Dean Church, who, in a note at the beginning of his well-known essay, says of J. A. Carlyle's literal prose rendering of the *Inferno*: 'To an English student beginning Dante, and wishing to study him in a scholarly manner, it is really more useful than a verse translation can be.'

(a) The translation in blank verse which is now best known is that of Longfellow (1867), in which he had the assistance throughout of two other distinguished American students of Dante, James Russell Lowell and Mr. Charles Eliot Norton, 'to whose critical attention every line and every word' is said to have been 'subjected, as the work passed through the press.' It is as close to the original as any metrical translation can be; but that very closeness occasions some not infrequent stiffness, and in other places obscurity. It is, however, on the whole, the best for general use, and it was employed, with a few exceptions, in the recent articles in THE EXPOSITORY TIMES. The price of the translation by itself in 'Morley's Universal Library' is only 1s.; but the edition at 3s. 6d. (Routledge), containing Longfellow's notes and a large mass of illustrative matter collected by him, should be used. It is a cheap book at the price, but the type and general *format* are not very attractive.

(b) In substitution for—or, better still, in addition to—Longfellow may be recommended Dean Plumptre's much less literal rendering of the Divine Comedy. It reproduces the complicated threefold rhyme (*terza rima*) of the original, and thus gives a good general impression of the style of the poem; but, of course, there is thus an aggravation of the difficulties in the way of representing its meaning at once accurately and distinctly. These difficulties, however, are met with much skill and considerable success; and on the same pages with the translation are exceedingly interesting notes, which show that wide acquaintance with Christian and other literature, and that consequent abundance of happy illustrations and instructive parallels, which characterize the commentaries and other writings of the learned Dean. Many of the notes are also particularly valuable in their bearing on those moral and religious aspects of Dante which, as has been said, are likely to constitute the chief interests of the readers of this magazine. The translation and notes are published in three rather small volumes, convenient and pleasant to hold, to carry, and to read (Isbister; 2s. 6d.* each). Uniform with them in size and in price are three supplementary volumes, containing respectively a translation of *The Minor Poems*, *A Life of Dante*, and *Studies and Estimates*. The six volumes are supplied in a case for 15s.* and are well worth the

money, as constituting in themselves a portable and fairly complete outfit for readers of Dante in English only.

(c, d) The older translations of the Rev. H. F. Cary in blank verse (1805-1812), and of I. C. Wright in rhyme somewhat similar to, though not identical with, that of Dante's *terza rima* (1833-1840), need not be dismissed as worthless by those who possess them, though of course the texts which are translated, and the stock of knowledge from which the notes are drawn, are below the standard which has been reached by later investigations. Mr. Wright's version had the honour of being used by Dean Church in the extracts quoted in his famous essay; and in the third and following editions there is prefixed to it a useful little collection of passages from Dante's prose works, which are among the most important as illustrating the Divine Comedy. Bohn's Libraries contain both these translations (3s. 6d. and 5s. respectively).

ii. Three available courses may be suggested for those who can refer with more or less ease to the Italian text of Dante; and it should be remembered that in this case 'a little knowledge'—even such as supplements rather than supersedes a translation, and such as cannot dispense with constant reference to a dictionary—is much better than no knowledge.

(a) Some such readers may find it best to content themselves at first with the deservedly popular Temple Edition in three light and handy volumes (Dent; 1s. 6d.* each in cloth, or 2s.* in leather, which is to be preferred, as the little books form excellent travelling companions). They contain the Italian text, and on the opposite pages a literal prose rendering. For the *Inferno* the much-praised translation of Dr. J. A. Carlyle (whose illustrious brother Thomas is said to have shown much interest in the work) has been used with some corrections; and for the *Purgatorio* and *Paradiso* respectively new translations have been made by Mr. Thomas Okey and the Rev. P. H. Wicksteed, the distinguished Unitarian minister.

(b) Turning from these cheap and light volumes to the opposite extreme of expensive and heavy ones,—heavy in the literal, but certainly not in the metaphorical sense,—undoubtedly the most complete and serviceable of all helps for those commencing the study of Dante in the original are the Hon. W. Warren Vernon's *Readings on the Inferno, on the Purgatorio, and on the Paradiso,*

each series being in two volumes (Macmillan; 3os., 24s., and 21s. for each pair of volumes). Their excellence could not be more highly vouched for than by the fact that commendatory prefaces to the three series have been written by such eminent English 'Dantists' as Dr. Moore, Dean Church, and Bishop Boyd Carpenter. They combine all the various kinds of assistance that the student is likely to require, such as ample historical and other notes, a clear division of each canto under several headings, a good modern text broken up into short paragraphs, each of which is preceded by a brief exposition of its general meaning, and followed by a very literal prose translation with brief parenthetical expansions or explanations where necessary. There are also two special points in which Mr. Vernon stands pre-eminent among the host of commentators, namely, his intimate personal knowledge of the idioms still used by the Tuscan peasantry, which sometimes throw a much-needed light upon expressions of the poet who 'was a Florentine and wrote for Tuscans,' and his abundant use of the earliest commentaries, and especially of the very full one by Benvenuto da Imola, which was first printed in our own times through the munificence of Mr. Vernon and his father, the late Lord Vernon. That commentary embodies lectures delivered by Benvenuto in and about the year 1375, not much more than half a century after Dante's death, and 'his remarks on the living persons mentioned in the poem are therefore particularly valuable. His observations on the subtle allegorical meanings also deserve serious attention as coming from one who may be said to speak in the full light of tradition' (Vernon's *Introd. to Inf.* p. xi).

(c) An intermediate course between (a) and (b), and the best for those who think the size or price of Mr. Vernon's six volumes unsuitable to their bookshelves or their purses, would be to combine the use of three first-rate books, all published by the Clarendon Press, namely, the *Oxford Text of Dante*, edited by Dr. Moore, and now generally considered the standard text (6s.* in one volume, or 10s. 6d. in a case of three miniature volumes on India paper), Mr. Tozer's prose translation already referred to (3s. 6d.*), and the same writer's very excellent *English Commentary on Dante's Divina Commedia* (8s. 6d.). The latter volume is particularly valuable for its brief but pointed intimations of the spiritual and moral teachings which are

allegorically signified by the imagery of the poem. Two specimens of these were given in THE EXPOSITORY TIMES, vol. xvi. pp. 497b, 500a; and some others may be seen in the notes to *Inf.* viii. 67, ix. 61, xxiii. 64; *Purg.* viii. 97, 103-5, ix. 94-102, xiii. 88, xix. 7-9, 10-15.

III. Other helps, chiefly subsidiary to those already mentioned.

(a) Whichever of the above books the student takes as his regular and constant guides, he will do well, especially as his knowledge advances, to have at hand for reference the Dante Dictionary of Dr. Paget Toynbee (Clarendon Press; 25s.*). In the absence of this and also of the *Life* by Plumptre, Dr. Toynbee's *Life of Dante* (Methuen; 3s. 6d.) would supply useful information about the poet's history and surroundings.

(b) All the three series of Dr. Moore's *Studies in Dante* are full of valuable matter (Clarendon Press; present price of the three volumes, 42s.*; the first of them being scarce, but the second and third are sold separately at 10s. 6d.* each). And the second of them should be specially named here, because our readers are likely to be particularly interested in the Essays which it contains on 'Dante as a Religious Teacher, especially in relation to Catholic Doctrine,' on the 'Classification of Sins in the "Inferno" and "Purgatorio,"' and on 'Dante's Personal Attitude towards different kinds of Sin.'

(c) Among the very numerous *Essays* on Dante, that of Dean Church, though written as long ago

as 1850, remains unequalled (now published by Macmillan with two other Essays, 4s.*). That of J. R. Lowell, in *Among my Books*, vol. i., is also well worth reading. And there is much to be learnt from Dr. Karl Witte's *Essays on Dante*, as 'selected and translated by C. Mabel Lawrence and P. H. Wicksteed' (Duckworth; 7s. 6d.).

(d) Among the volumes that have been devoted to the elucidation of separate divisions of the Divine Comedy, may be mentioned two of rather different kinds, namely, the exposition of the *Inferno* published by the Rev. J. S. Carroll under the title *Exiles of Eternity* (Hodder & Stoughton; 7s. 6d.*), some samples of which may be seen in THE EXPOSITORY TIMES, vol. xvii. p. 39, and the thoughtful work of Mr. E. G. Gardner on the *Paradiso*, called *Dante's Ten Heavens* (Constable; 5s.).

(e) Dante's prose works are not often found interesting by those who are not already lovers of his great poem, but they are exceedingly useful in throwing light upon it. Especially this is the case as to the *Convito*, now beginning to be known more correctly as the *Convivio*. It may be well, therefore, to mention that a good translation of it, under the name of *The Banquet of Dante*, has been published by Miss Katharine Hillard (Kegan Paul; 7s. 6d.). Added to it, in an Appendix, is a translation of the very probably genuine—and, if genuine, extremely important—Epistle of Dante to Can Grande, which was quoted in THE EXPOSITORY TIMES, xvii. 41 f.

Christian Faith.¹

BY THE REV. DAVID PURVES, D.D., BELFAST.

THE fact that a book of the worth and thoroughness of this one should stand over the name of a comparatively unknown writer is an indication of the extent to which the scientific study of theology is still carried on in certain Scottish manses. Dr. Ferries is a minister of the Church of Scotland, and this fine piece of work has emanated from an Aberdeenshire manse. The title is sufficiently descriptive of the aim of the volume, which is to trace the growth of Christian faith in the individual

¹ *The Growth of Christian Faith.* By George Ferries, D.D. Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark. 7s. 6d. net.

believer. To some extent it is also a history of the growth of faith in the Church, but the idea of the book is to show that Christian faith, especially in the case of those who have been influenced by the thought of our own time, is a growth, and is not attained in a moment of moral revolution. After stating the religious situation and prospect of the present moment, which is summed up in the sentence, 'There is heartfelt interest together with a suspension of judgment, people being in a strait betwixt two,' he goes on to show that the acquisition of faith in